

Interactive comment on “Ocean acidification: setting the record straight” by A. J. Andersson and F. T. Mackenzie

J. Hauck

judith.hauck@awi.de

Received and published: 18 July 2011

J. Hauck¹, C.-D. Hillenbrand², M. Hoppema¹, G. Kuhn¹, G. Nehrke¹, C. Völker¹, D. Wolf-Gladrow¹

¹ Alfred Wegener Institute for Polar and Marine Research, Postfach 12 01 61, 27515 Bremerhaven, Germany

² British Antarctic Survey, High Cross, Madingley Road, Cambridge CB3 0ET, United Kingdom

Andersson and Mackenzie (2011) cite our talk on “Carbonate sediments on Antarctic shelves and implications for a mechanism to buffer Ocean Acidification in the Southern Ocean” at the ASLO Aquatic Sciences Meeting in San Juan, Puerto Rico, in February

C2056

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



2011 (Hauck et al., 2011) as an example for investigating possible buffering effects by CaCO_3 dissolution of shelf sediments.

We agree with the authors in their recommendations that the points "evidence of a buffer effect" (when the seawater is already undersaturated with respect to CaCO_3), "kinetics", and "physical mixing" should be considered in studies addressing a possible buffer effect. We would like to add another step (Step Zero), which has to happen even before these considerations: proper quantification of how much CaCO_3 is available in the region considered and identification of the mineral composition (aragonite, calcite, magnesium rich calcites). This very first step is what we presented at the ASLO Meeting (Hauck et al., 2011).

We would also like to add that a discussion on the (global) buffering capacity of shallow carbonates as general as applied by Andersson et al. (2003) might not be applicable to all regions of the World Ocean as various relevant factors (mineral composition, physical mixing, temperature effects on thermodynamic equilibria and kinetics) may be different from the global mean in one specific region, e.g., Andersson et al. (2007) found an example where alkalinity accumulation occurs in Devil's Hole, Bermuda.

Second, the authors (p. 6173, line 17ff) recommend to "keep in mind that most of the anthropogenic CO_2 absorbed by the oceans is taken up in the open ocean and is not available for dissolution of shallow-water carbonate phases unless the acidified water is upwelled and/or onwelled into coastal waters." This is not the case in the Southern Ocean; here a large portion of the CO_2 is taken up along the shelf and only on the shelf anthropogenic CO_2 is able to penetrate down to depths of ca. 1000 m (Hauck et al., 2010; Arrigo et al., 2008).

The article of Loáiciga (2006) is 'Based on inappropriate assumptions and erroneous thermodynamic calculations ...' (see comment by Caldeira et al., 2007) and should not be cited without the comment by Caldeira et al. (2007), if at all. It is o.k. to criticize our work, however, we feel affronted by citing Loáiciga (2006) and Hauck et al. (2011) in

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

the same sentence.

References:

Andersson Mackenzie (2011): Ocean acidification: setting the record straight. *Bio-geosciences Discussions* 8, 6161 – 6190, doi:10.5194/bgd-8-6161-2011.

Andersson, A. J., Mackenzie, F. T., and Ver, L. M. (2003): Solution of shallow-water carbonates: an insignificant buffer against rising atmospheric CO₂, *Geology*, 31, 513–516.

Andersson, A. J., Bates, N. R., and Mackenzie, F. T. (2007): Dissolution of carbonate sediments under rising pCO₂ and ocean acidification: observations from Devil's Hole, Bermuda, *Aquat. Geochem.*, 13, 237–264.

Arrigo, K. R., G. van Dijken, and M. Long (2008): Coastal Southern Ocean: A strong anthropogenic CO₂ sink, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 35, L21602, doi:10.1029/2008GL035624.

Caldeira, K., et al. (2007), Comment on “Modern-age buildup of CO₂ and its effects on seawater acidity and salinity” by Hugo A. Loáiciga, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 34, L18608, doi:10.1029/2006GL027288.

Hauck, J., Hillenbrand, C. D., Hoppema, M., Kuhn, G., Nehrke, G., and Wolf-Gladrow, D. (2011): Carbonate sediments on Antarctic shelves and implications for a mechanism to buffer ocean acidification in the Southern Ocean, *Book of Abstracts, Aquatic Sciences Meeting*, 13–18 February, San Juan, Puerto Rico, 2011.

Hauck, J., M. Hoppema, R. G. J. Bellerby, C. Völker, and D. Wolf-Gladrow (2010): Data-based estimation of anthropogenic carbon and acidification in the Weddell Sea on a decadal timescale, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 115, C03004, doi:10.1029/2009JC005479.

Loáiciga, H. A.: Modern age buildup of CO₂ and its effects on seawater acidity and salinity, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 33, L10605, doi:10.1029/2006GL026305, 2006.

BGD

8, C2056–C2059, 2011

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

